NOT SORRY FOR DOING IT, BUT VERY SORRY FOR GETTING CAUGHT: DEALING WITH PLAGIARISM IN THE ASIA PACIFIC CLASSROOM

Presented by
LEANDA CARE
Partner, International Management & HR
AMusA, BA (Hons), MBA, PhD

Contributing author
YVONNE MCNULTY
Human Resources Business Administration
BBus (Hons), PhD

IGamiX
Management & Consulting Ltd
Intelligent Gaming Executives
It’s a dirty word

April 20, 2015 9.21pm AEST

Australian unis should take responsibility for corrupt practices in international education

Lawyers ticked off for ‘cut and paste’ job

Big rise in cheating cases at UK varsities

17,000 cases in 2009-10 academic year - up at least 50% in four years

London: A cheating epidemic is sweeping British universities, with thousands of students caught for plagiarism, trying to bribe lecturers and buying essays from the Web. A survey of more than 80 universities has found that incidents of academic misconduct are ballooning at institutions across the country.

More than 17,000 cases of cheating were recorded by universities in the 2009-10 academic year - up at least 50% in four years, the Telegraph reported yesterday.

Cheats in one university were detected after they had entered work that contained identical errors. Another student was found to have copied from Wikipedia.

A significant number of dishonest students also bought coursework from internet-based essay-writing companies.

World

The Straits Times Monday, March 7, 2011 PAGE A15

Scores highly in India’s schools

Focus on grades, pressure to escape poverty trap, say in India, where government schools place an extraordinary emphasis on exams in all subjects, according to experts.
It’s a dirty word

Public safety first - nursing academic standards

Monday 27 Apr 2015

A leading nursing academic at Charles Sturt University (CSU) is concerned about allegations of poor standards at some universities aired by the ABC TV Four Corners program on Monday 20 April.

Associate Professor David Stanley, Head of the CSU School of Nursing, Midwifery and Indigenous Health, said, “There was no suggestion in the Four Corners report that the problems identified at some other universities also applied to Charles Sturt University, but the negative connotation is regrettable.”

Professor Stanley said while the allegations are serious and disappointing, he endorses the position statement issued by Professor Wendy Cross, Chair of the Council of Deans of Nursing and Midwifery, Australia and New Zealand (CDNM).

“As the Council of Deans of Nursing and Midwifery states, the safety of individual patients and the wider public is central to the education of our nursing students,” Professor Stanley said.

Professor Stanley noted that relative to other universities, CSU has fewer international students and he was unaware of any instances of English language illiteracy among CSU nursing graduates. He rejected suggestions that universities have ‘dumbed down’ curricula, assessment, and entry standards.

• Not just about academic integrity, ownership of ideas or originality
• It’s also about safety
• Contributions

We have a duty of care
This study

• Explores reasons for the prevalence of plagiarism
• Discussions with 6 highly experience western academics
  – 9 to over 30 years
  – in USA, Canada, Australia, Israel, South Africa, Singapore, Malaysia, India, Vietnam, Sri Lanka, Switzerland, Kazakhstan, Macau, Latvia, Hong Kong
• Offer a list of tell-tale signs
• Types of plagiarism
• Vignettes of responses to detection and reporting

Suggest: Drivers to plagiarise and disincentives to detect and report
The Asia Pacific Academic Environment

• Massification of education has brought with it a different type of student

• Extra-ordinary growth in the region to continue

Table 2: Global tertiary education enrolments, 2000 and 2009 actuals and projected to 2035

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>2000 actual</th>
<th>2009 actual</th>
<th>2020 projected</th>
<th>2030 projected</th>
<th>2035 projected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Arab States</td>
<td>5,425,160</td>
<td>7,743,147</td>
<td>11,028,796</td>
<td>14,571,465</td>
<td>16,749,073</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Central and Eastern Europe</td>
<td>14,121,891</td>
<td>20,927,779</td>
<td>24,139,780</td>
<td>28,158,853</td>
<td>30,412,756</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Central Asia</td>
<td>1,405,424</td>
<td>2,103,714</td>
<td>2,395,222</td>
<td>2,849,458</td>
<td>3,107,926</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>East Asia and the Pacific</td>
<td>24,885,620</td>
<td>52,444,449</td>
<td>96,652,073</td>
<td>163,661,598</td>
<td>212,968,120</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latin America and the Caribbean</td>
<td>11,431,895</td>
<td>19,657,851</td>
<td>31,363,694</td>
<td>48,013,219</td>
<td>59,405,633</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North America and Western Europe</td>
<td>27,665,919</td>
<td>35,489,364</td>
<td>42,258,362</td>
<td>48,527,689</td>
<td>52,002,962</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South and West Asia</td>
<td>12,091,348</td>
<td>21,414,768</td>
<td>45,759,402</td>
<td>89,791,839</td>
<td>125,781,024</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sub-Saharan Africa</td>
<td>2,457,353</td>
<td>4,800,440</td>
<td>9,404,871</td>
<td>16,622,177</td>
<td>22,098,126</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

|                   | 99,484,608  | 164,581,513 | 263,002,200    | 412,196,298    | 522,525,620    |


Source: Calderon, 2012
The Asia Pacific Academic Environment
Extra-ordinary growth in the region to continue

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Region</th>
<th>2000 actual</th>
<th>2009 actual</th>
<th>2020 projected</th>
<th>2030 projected</th>
<th>2035 projected</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Arab States</td>
<td>3.18</td>
<td>3.47</td>
<td>3.85</td>
<td>4.18</td>
<td>4.43</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Central and Eastern Europe</td>
<td>4.52</td>
<td>6.52</td>
<td>7.61</td>
<td>8.85</td>
<td>9.68</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Central Asia</td>
<td>2.89</td>
<td>3.71</td>
<td>3.76</td>
<td>3.96</td>
<td>4.14</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>East Asia and the Pacific</td>
<td>1.69</td>
<td>3.15</td>
<td>5.32</td>
<td>8.66</td>
<td>11.27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latin America and the Caribbean</td>
<td>3.27</td>
<td>4.79</td>
<td>6.50</td>
<td>8.98</td>
<td>10.74</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>North America and Western Europe</td>
<td>5.02</td>
<td>6.01</td>
<td>6.77</td>
<td>7.52</td>
<td>7.99</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South and West Asia</td>
<td>1.30</td>
<td>1.88</td>
<td>3.29</td>
<td>5.61</td>
<td>7.44</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Africa</td>
<td>0.70</td>
<td>1.07</td>
<td>1.55</td>
<td>2.11</td>
<td>2.47</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>World</td>
<td>2.37</td>
<td>3.38</td>
<td>4.69</td>
<td>6.63</td>
<td>8.08</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Sources:**
Student enrolments: UNESCO Institute for Statistics
Population: UN Department of Economic and Social Affairs
Author estimates for 2020-35 student enrolments

**Participation rate:**
proportion of the population aged 15 to 79 in tertiary education

Source: Calderon, 2012
The international/ESL student factor

• There is a market – internationalisation and massification of education
• There is a business to be had
• We find now: Lax admission requirements, falsification of qualifications, Second Language difficulties, differing academic norms, educational background, value systems (originality, reverence, independent thought)
Drivers of plagiarism

• Factors
  – Economic
    • Student needs – qualification/visa at all costs
    • Institutional commercial imperatives – keep the student in at all costs (management vs academic staff)
  – Educational Norms & Standards
    • Students and staff with different schema
    • Students insufficiently prepared and selected
Tell-tale signs

• What do you look for?
• Have technology?

1. Better than expected quality of writing
2. Font changes
3. Increase in # citations
4. Citations not in reference list
5. Sudden change in person
6. Sudden change in tense

Training and development is useful in various ways –

1. Help in finding out employee weaknesses: Nobody is perfect here every individual has his own weaknesses which can affect his work and it hinders him to play his role in the development of the company or organisation so with their these imperfections they cannot give their best which is most valuable in the improvement of any company or organisation. But training is the only way to get release from all these weaknesses it strengthens workers skills. Skilled and other old employee works as the trainer and learn them in the comfortable ways. So by getting training the differences between the old and the new employees can be removed and they all can work at the same level without any distinction. A trainer or the old employee have knowledge about the faults of the new one because they have pass through these situations so they can easily find out and guide them to improve their faults. As this way they become co-operative with one another which is very necessary because it is rightly said union is strength. When all the workers will have the equal knowledge then they will become more competitive with one another which will play a vital role in the development of the company because of equal knowledge and equal opportunities whole workforce is reliable, so the company or organization doesn’t have to rely only on specific employees.

2. Development in workers performance -A properly trained employee becomes more informed about procedures for various tasks. The worker confidence is grows by training and development. This confidence comes from the good performance of the worker. When any worker gets appreciation or reward because of his work he gets confidence and try to work hard to improve his performance more and more and by giving much attention to his work the worker becomes fully aware of his/her roles and responsibilities. It helps the worker to do duties in better way and even he becomes more creative and try to make new inventions and apply new ideas for the development of the company. It is not sure he or his new ideas always will be successful but it is sure after some mistakes he will be able to make right decisions which will be beneficial both for the amelioration of both the company and the individual. Their right decision can work as a feather in
Tell-tale signs

7. change in writing style and/or quality
8. Year/tense inconsistency

Macao will apply for inclusion of the “Historical Monument of Macao” in the World Heritage list of UNESCO in 2005. Recently, it has undertaken work in preparation for this application and tried to raise the profile of Macao through heightening public awareness of its cultural tourism features and publicizing extensively Macao’s unique blend of Chinese and Portuguese cultures.

From a local Chinese MBA student in Macau, 2009

9. Nonsense writing

We have made a proposal to the company to accept the retrenchment packages as soon as the work is finished and then we present the work of the external factors. There are constant changes in policy falls heavily politicized by the government is subject to the project.
Tell-tale signs

10. A reference list copied from elsewhere
11. Details in document properties do not reflect the identity of the student
12. Review properties’ details inconsistent with type/length of assignment.
13. Some elements of assignment not dealt with
14. Lack of cohesive argument
15. Lots of irrelevant information
16. Prior knowledge of the student
Types

Do student with different attributes plagiarise in different ways?

– We seem to see different methods used by different students

1. Ghost-writing, purloining
2. Verbatim copying
3. Citing verbatim without quotation marks
4. Translating sources from other languages
Types

5. Secondary source plagiarism

6. Misrepresentation of the source

because they have more experience and greater knowledge than those they manage, and it is, therefore, unnecessary, and even inappropriate for them to consult with lower-ranking individuals when decision-making.

Managers are more autocratic than in many other countries. Managers do not seek a consensus before making decisions. They tell subordinates what they want done and how they expect them to perform the task. Subordinates follow a manager’s

7. Synonym replacement

Original text:

not all millennials are job hoppers

Student submission:

Not all millennials are employment containers.
Disincentives – the problem continues

• Busy staff and students who rely on our busyness (or on us being lazy or stupid or beyond caring)
• Confronting and confrontational
• Inadequate investment to eradicate – no ‘rigorous approach’
  – Lacking policies, procedures, technology
  – Little training of staff and students
• Differing understandings of importance of the principles of academic honesty. Students/academics/business staff
• Higher priorities: “How dare you make accusations!”
  – Individual level: Cultural values – relationships over process, nepotism, cronyism.
  – Institutional level: Student admission numbers.
  – Regulatory level: Attrition is an indictment on teaching excellence.
Searching for answers

• The traditional recommendations
  – Institutional policies and procedures (including technological solutions, better admissions processes and training of staff & students)
  – Dependence upon individual academic staff

• Different thinking – beyond penalisation
  – A system of incentives and organisational cultural change that rewards academic staff and students for ‘clean submissions’, independent thought and contribution.
Conclusion

It’s tactically simple to remove plagiarism from the classroom

Sheer dogged determination, laborious use of time and effort, set clear expectations and guidelines with students, consistently apply systems of normative training (even at masters level), re-submission and consequences - including non-negotiable failure

• Institutional (formal and informal) interests undermine attempts.

• Patterns in types of plagiarism dependent upon student attributes
THE STUDY GOES ON: Questions to ponder

Pleased to receive your thoughts: leanda.care@monash.edu

? Does student plagiarism really matter?

? How are you supported/undermined by your college/university in endeavours to eradicate academic dishonesty?

? How much autonomy do you have to request a resubmission or fail students in their assignments/subject/course for detected plagiarism? – Does intention to deceive play a role in procedural decisions?
Questions to ponder – the nitty-gritty

? How do you detect plagiarism? Are you in a state of heightened awareness as you grade papers?

? What forms of plagiarism do you find?

? What are the typical forms of plagiarism that you detect?

? What types of students are most likely to plagiarise and how?

leanda.care@monash.edu